

Draft

Metaphor, White Slavery and Trafficking

Jo Doezema
Institute of Development Studies
University of Sussex
April 2005

Unless we make energetic and successful war upon the red light districts and all that pertains to them, we shall have Oriental brothel slavery thrust upon us from China and Japan, and Parisian white slavery, with all its unnatural and abominable practices, established among us by the French traders. Jew traders, too, will people our “levees” with Polish Jewesses and any others who will make money for them. Shall we defend our American civilization, or lower our flag to the most despicable foreigners – French, Irish, Italians, Jews and Mongolians? We do not speak against them for their nationality, but for their crimes.’ But this is then refuted by the next bit: ‘On the Pacific Coast eternal vigilance alone can save us from a flood of Asiaticism, with its weak woman hood, its regimen of scant chivalry, its polluting vices and its brothel slavery...On both coasts and throughout all our cities, only an awakening of the whole Christian conscience and intelligence can save us from the importation of Parisian and Polish pollution, which is already corrupting the manhood and youth of every large city in this nation (Bell 1910: 259)

Metaphor and myth

‘Metaphor’ is a term used by a number of white slavery historians to explain the effectiveness of the myth of white slavery. For example, Grittner (1990) and Irwin (1996) both rely on Geertz’s notion of metaphor, developed in *Ideology as cultural practice*. In this highly influential 1969 essay, Geertz champions the application of literary theory to cultural analysis (a defining feature of structuralism), in particular, the role of metaphor in ideology. Metaphor, argues Geertz, works in ideology because it makes complicated reality intelligible. Grittner’s exploration of the metaphorical meanings of white slavery combines this interpretation with Connelly’s (1980) psycho-social approach. Connelly argues that white-slavery, and the larger movement to eliminate prostitution of which it was a part, reflected American social angst: ‘The central argument [of his book] is that antiprostitution had at least as much to do with the anxieties produced by the transformation of American society occurring in the progressive era as with the actual existence of red-light districts’ (1980: 6).

These approaches are valuable, in that they move our attention from a misguided search for the ‘facts’ of white slavery, to an exploration of the function of the myth of white slavery in society. However, there are a number of problems with the ‘myth as metaphor’ approach, which are not dealt with by white slavery historians in their appropriation of the conceptual apparatus of myth and metaphor. By pointing out these problems, I do not mean that the metaphor approach should be discarded. These analysis point to the need for more careful attention to the

Draft

relationship between metaphor and myth, to allow the idea of the white slave as a symbol and the myth of white slavery as metaphor to retain analytical value; in particular when applying these to trafficking in women.

First, the correspondence between the metaphor and the social anxiety that is claimed to have prompted it seems arbitrary.¹ Why would concerns about urbanisation, for example, take the form of a myth about white slavery? Wouldn't some other myth have done as well? Why that particular myth, at that particular time? Equally, it is possible to ascribe any number of plausible metaphorical meanings to the myth of white slavery – so the white slave has been argued to symbolise everything from fear of women's sexuality, to the growing commercialisation of labour.² Second, these approaches remain rooted in the idea of myth as distortion, of white slavery as mythical because it hid the truth. Third, these approaches also fail to account for the instability of the white slavery myth, for the need for the discursive purity of the white slave to be preserved through anxious attempts to place her always on the right side of consent. As WT Stead's notorious 'Maiden Tribute to Modern Babylon' so clearly shows, female virtue was ever in danger of transforming into vice. The demarcation line of consent had to be vigorously policed (literally), were not all women to slip into the chthonic, chaotic, inverted underworld of prostitution; invoking the terrifying vision of the community itself inverted, topsy-turvy, the back-to-front morality of carnival come to stay for good.³

Finally, there is the simplest but perhaps most serious problem: why dress up practical concerns in symbolic language at all? Why weren't the concerns – with urbanisation, immigration, etc. – addressed directly? Geertz (1969) and other proponents of the metaphor approach argue that it is because myth simplifies a complicated reality. However, the myth of white slavery was anything but simple, with a great number of possible meanings and interpretations, and used by a great variety of actors in society. Myth is powerful not because it simplifies reality, but because it carries a vision of how that reality could be.

¹ The concerns about the arbitrariness of the connections between metaphor and reality in accounts of white slavery were inspired by Henry Tudor's (1972) observations about the allegorical interpretation of myth. Tudor argues against a hermeneutical interpretation of myth because a given myth could have a number of possible allegorical interpretations. According to Tudor, the questions of *why* messages were encoded in mythical language at all is not answered by a hermeneutical approach.

² Hobson (1987) shows a recognition of the problems with the metaphorical approach in her critique of Connelly (1990), when she takes him to task for an over-reliance on the psycho-social interpretation of prostitution. She suggests that the concern with prostitution expressed in 'anti-prostitution' and white slavery campaigns actually *was* a concern with prostitution. She does, however, recognise the 'symbolic content' of anti-prostitution, in particular the campaign against white slavery.

³ See Bell (1994) for an application of Bakhtin's notion of the 'carnavalesque' to western prostitution discourse.

Draft

This point, as well as a more satisfactory account of the nature of the relationship between metaphor and myth, is made clear in Laclau's work on metaphor and ideology. Myth, as set out by Laclau in *New Reflections on the Revolution of our Time* (1990), is metaphor: the 'metaphor for an absent fullness' (Torfing 1999: 115); the fullness of the community. Applying Laclau's framework to the notion of metaphor used by Connelly and Grittner enriches our understanding of the term and provides a clearer link between the concepts of myth and metaphor. In *The Death and Resurrection of the Theory of Ideology* (1997) Laclau applies Derrida's deconstruction to the notion of 'community': community is both impossible and necessary. Impossible, because all of the certainties and fixed characteristics that make up a 'community' can only be understood in relation to a 'constitutive outside'. For Laclau, community only exists in relation to what doesn't belong to it, an idea made familiar by Said's (Said 1976) concept of 'the Other'. The 'impossibility' of community comes about as the community strives for completeness, for closure, for 'fullness' in Laclau's terminology. However, this 'fullness' can never be achieved because community only exists through defining itself against something else. The essence of community is its incompleteness, hence, the 'complete community' is what Laclau calls 'the necessary but impossible object' (1997: 298). The impossible community is a political struggle for hegemony: a conflict between a discursively constructed 'us' and 'them'. At the same time, community is necessary, because humans create and maintain identities through this impossible object. From this paradoxically impossible and necessary space arises myth.

Myth serves a function in the political struggles which define communities: it provides a 'surface of inscription' on which 'dislocations and social demands' can be written (Laclau 1990: 65, 68). At the same time, myth is used by groups in the social struggle to provide a vision of their version of the ideal society, a society in which their 'community' is complete and the threatening 'Other' no longer exists. Myth serves to 'suture' social dislocations through a representation of how society could be (Laclau 1990: 62). So we can see that for Laclau, myth operates in two manners; it is both the surface on which social demands are inscribed and at the same time a model of how society should be. This representation of society – the model of the ideal society – is what Laclau terms 'metaphor'. And, like the 'impossible communities' they represent, myth is incomplete: 'social myths are essentially incomplete: their content is constantly reconstituted and displaced' (Laclau 1990: 63). So Laclau helps us look for meaning in the very contradictions and variations within the myth of white slavery.

This is significant for looking at the myth of trafficking. This paper traces the genealogy of the trafficking myth through examining discourses of white slavery. I concentrate on the metaphor of

Draft

white slavery as it functioned in the United States. Though the focus is historical, the genealogical link to contemporary debates on trafficking will be signposted. In particular, this paper serves to historically locate the threat to the community which was inscribed on and in the myth of white slavery. As a preliminary formulation, I will suggest that in Progressive era America, the myth of white slavery was a metaphor in which American society struggled to realise itself through discursive constructions of race and gender. The implications for a study of contemporary myths of trafficking are indicated throughout the text.

The American anti-white slavery campaign

According to one estimate, over one billion pages on the subject of prostitution were written in America between 1900 and 1920 (Haag 1999). Forty cities formed so-called 'vice commissions' to investigate the extent of prostitution in their municipalities. White slavery laws were adopted to halt the feared national and international trade in women. The white slave herself became the subject of a huge number of books, articles, plays, and sculptures. Across America, groups were set up to abolish 'the social evil': prostitution. The groups involved in fighting prostitution were varied, and included women's groups, temperance organisations, religious groups, and medical associations. These organisations often differed in their ideologies and goals, but were able to unite around one issue: the elimination of prostitution. In their efforts to root out 'the social evil', they were greatly influenced by the British campaign against white-slavery. However, while the English experience may have provided a template for activism, there was also a home-grown tradition of purity reform for American campaigners to draw on.

Early purity

While campaigns against prostitution in America have a long history, in the early 19th century, a new approach to prostitution emerged. This approach, according to Connelly, was a result of urbanisation, which made prostitution more visible, and was 'influenced... by evangelical and perfectionist notions of social reform' (Connelly 1980). Groups such as the Women's New York Female Reform Society, founded in 1834, combined evangelical zeal with crusading efforts at social reform, in their attempts to convert prostitutes and close New York City's brothels (Smith-Rosenberg 1985). However, before the civil war, prostitution as an issue for social reform was less important than slavery and temperance. In the 1860s and 70s, concern around prostitution led to a "purity crusade". Groups of women, anti-slavery campaigners, religious groups and temperance organisations joined in a fight dedicated to 'the regeneration of American sexual morality' (Connelly 1980: 5). Their main efforts were directed against 'regulationists'. Led mainly by doctors concerned with venereal disease, inspired by European experiences, they attempted to establish regulation of prostitution in Chicago, St. Louis and New York.

By the mid-1880s, the purity agenda had grown to include child rearing, moral education, social hygiene, and prohibition. Prostitution was still important, but it remained mainly a local issue: ‘The suppression of prostitution was one plank in a broad platform of social purity: child rearing, sex and moral education, social hygiene, and temperance were elements of a moral vision that emphasized self-control and moderation’ (Grittner 1990: 43). It wasn’t until the first decade of the 19th century that prostitution was to become a national issue.

Modernisation

Between 1890 and the beginning of WW1, American society underwent a great transformation, from ‘a predominantly rural-minded, decentralised, principally Anglo-Saxon, production-oriented and morally absolutist society to a predominantly urban, centralised, multi-ethnic, consumption oriented, secular and relativist society’ (Connelly 1980: 7). In the 1870s, America both saw itself as, and actually was, still a nation of farms and small towns. The dominance of agriculture in the economy was challenged by the industrial revolution. ‘By the 1880s and 1890s, the structure of American industry had changed dramatically. Centralized, large-scale manufacturing, national markets, giant corporations, finance capitalism, had concentrated economic power in a few cities’ (Smith-Rosenberg 1985: 170).

The nature of immigration to America also changed dramatically between 1890 and the beginning of WW1. Whereas 19th century immigration was mostly from Northern Europe and Scandinavia, the new century saw the arrival of increasing numbers from Southern Europe, Russia, and the Austro-Hungarian empire. Connelly (1980) calls the arrival of ‘over thirteen million immigrants’ between 1900 and 1914: ‘one of the most profound social and demographic transformations in American history’ (p. 48). These changes inspired a range of reactions across the spectrum of American politics. Haag (1999) divides these reactions into two principle camps: ‘one that espoused a romantic-racial “uplift” of the immigrant to citizenship and another that endorsed the exclusion of “savage” races’ (p. 95). She calls these an ‘assimilationist’ and a ‘eugenicist’ tendency. The official creation and public reaction to white slavery took shape in conversation with both of these tendencies.

These massive changes, though in one sense the pride of an America which viewed itself as the most modern of societies, were also in tension with a society that prided itself on its traditional values. As Smith-Rosenberg (1985) colourfully describes it: ‘Small-town Americans had become flotsam and jetsam in the ongoing maturation of American capitalism’ who viewed the cities as ‘Sodom and Gomorrah of sexual excess and sybaritic indulgence, Babels of conflicting

Draft

languages, religions and customs, chaotic, ungovernable, the great cities epitomized the foreign, the unknown, and the dangerous' (p. 171-2). But it was not only small towners who experienced a heady mixture of anxiety and the sense of new possibilities afforded by America's modernisation. In the cities and suburbs, new political actors emerged whose ideologies combined bold hopes for remedying societal ills with traditional prejudices. Their reforming zeal characterised the first decades of the twentieth century in America, which is known as the Progressive Era.

Progressivism and prostitution

The reforming impulse of the Progressive era captured the ambiguities between tradition and progress, fear and fascination; resulting from the rapid social changes in the decades around the turn of the century. Middle-class, educated men and women turned their attention to the plight of the city's working classes and immigrants, tackling a range of issues including housing, delinquency, child labour, and women's wages. While the range of organisations and individuals had differing, and even conflicting, ideas about why, how, and which situations needed reforming, they had a number of things in common. These included a belief in 'expert' knowledge, the power of statistics, and new notion of the relationship between the state and the citizen. According to Hobson (1987), this had two key elements: firstly, 'the state had to take a more active role in regulating the social welfare of its citizens', and secondly, 'that the private and public spheres of activity could not be disentangled' (p. 140).

It was in the context of great social upheaval and the anxiety and hope that these changes brought that prostitution became a nation-wide issue of concern. According to Connelly (1990): 'What produced the full-throated alarm of the progressive years was a new evaluation of prostitution's significance...during the progressive years...[prostitution's] inherent capacity to provoke fear and alarm was greatly expanded' (p. 6). It was not all fear and alarm, however: the Progressive rejection of regulation, of the idea of prostitution as 'a necessary evil', embodied a great, hopeful optimism about the possibilities of radical social change. As Hobson (1987) describes it, Progressive views of prostitution involved 'a belief that the state should create a net to catch those fallen outside its protection and should suppress rather than manage the business of prostitution' (p. 140).⁴ Prostitution reformers combined Progressive ideals such as improved health and better working and living conditions for the working class with social purity ideals of sexual continence. This led, according to Nicky Roberts, to an equation between poor working/living conditions and immorality (Roberts 1992). Individual prostitutes were also ideal

⁴ Haag (1999) makes the most radical claims about the effect of the white slavery campaigns on changing liberal ideologies, arguing that the Progressive responses to prostitution helped shape the modern notion of personal freedom which encompasses, for example, sexual and reproductive freedoms.

Draft

candidates for reformers of all ilks, from conservative religious to feminist. Well-meaning, but intrusive and restraining on the lives of prostitutes, these reforming activities embodied another formative tension within the Progressive spirit: that between social justice and social control (Hobson 1987).

Here we can plant the first genealogical signpost. The societal changes occurring during the Progressive years in America were not happening in isolation. While hardly today's so-called 'global village', the world in this period was undergoing a number of disruptions which parallel those of today. These included mass migration, industrialisation, and the most significant, the seeds of the disintegration of the old global order of British-dominated colonialism. Today, the concern with trafficking is most clearly linked with the huge global movements of people. These migrations are indicators and results of varied global changes, brought together under the name 'globalisation'. Historians using the metaphorical approach to white slavery have argued that it was precisely the anxiety produced by these changes that gave the myth its potency and power. Though one must be careful not to place too much weight on the broad similarities between the global social/political/economic situation of the pre-WWI one decades and those of today, it may be that the similarities in the stories of white slavery and those of trafficking reflect also the similarities in the broad social contexts in which they occurred.

The white slave as symbol

The actions led by local purity groups against regulation in cities such as San Francisco, New York, and Chicago, were largely successful. However, dedicated as purity campaigners were to abolishing prostitution entirely, the fight against regulation never became a national issue, simply because regulation itself never became a national issue (Hobson 1987). This was largely down to a lack of enthusiasm on the part of doctors. American medical opinion, after some support for regulation, moved towards favouring the suppression of prostitution as the best route to stopping the spread of venereal disease. The issue that sparked national concern was white slavery.

However, it is a mistake to see 'white slavery' as a distinct, bounded area within the larger area of concern with prostitution.⁵ For campaigners, policy makers and the public, the distinctions between prostitution and white slavery were blurred or non-existent: for many, white slavery was synonymous with prostitution. (This will be explored further below).

Nonetheless, it was when prostitution was grasped through the myth of white slavery that it began to resonate with the national conscience. British campaigners' success in whipping up public support for the cause of eliminating prostitution through horrific tales of white slavery

⁵ Most historians do take this approach, Haag (1999) being a notable exception.

Draft

inspired American reformers. According to Grittner (1990), ‘American efforts to abolish prostitution foundered, but the efforts of British purity leaders to outlaw the practice they defined as “white slavery” soon gave American reformers hope’ (p. 43). It was however, the more sensationalist and repressive elements of the British campaign against white slavery that were to prove more influential in the United States. William Stead’s *The Maiden Tribute* (1885) was published in America and was widely read and commented on; Stead himself visited Chicago to meet with anti-prostitution campaigners. America’s ‘home grown’ campaign for moral reform, of which the elimination of ‘vice’ was a chief element, was helped along by British ‘social purity’ campaigners, such as William Coote. Coote set up the National Vigilance Association (NVA) in 1911, with a repressive moral agenda that focused on the sexual behaviour of young people. The NVA was very active in the British campaign against white slavery and, according to Walkowitz (1980) was responsible for the increasingly repressive turn that the movement took. Josephine Butler resigned her membership in the NVA in protest. Coote was instrumental in turning American purity’s attention to ‘the white slave trade’. On a visit to America in 1906, he led a ‘successful campaign’ to establish an American version of the NVA (Grittner 1990).

All this activity around white slavery led to a huge outpouring of narrative material. As in Britain, the white slavery narratives in the United States took various forms, from books, newspaper articles, and reports to films, paintings and sculptures. As in Britain, these representations displayed a variety of narrative conventions such as crime drama and gothic fiction. Throughout these ran melodrama, in which virtue was pitted against vice in an uncomplicated moral tale (Grittner 1990). As in the contemporary accounts of trafficking, the victim’s virtue was rhetorically achieved through a number of devices: by stressing the youth of the victim, her whiteness, and her unwillingness to be a prostitute. In line with melodramatic convention, virtue had her counterpart, the evil white slave trader. Like the British version of the white slave myth, the innocent victim was constructed through the ghostly presence of her opposite: the prostitute as symbol of social disorder. However, melodrama’s cardboard cast of characters were filled out with particularly American concerns.

If we apply Laclau’s (1990) formulation of myth to this particular historical juncture, we can postulate that the social disorder that the myth attempted to suture was due to the ‘dislocation’ of American society as a result of changing patterns of work, living, and gender, race, and class relations. The white slave, in the American symbolic incarnation, stood for more than the loss of sexual innocence. She stood for loss of an entire, disappearing, and imagined ‘American way of life’: imagined because the notions of gender, race, class, and geography on which this way of life

Draft

depended were never stable, were never just 'the way things were'. The myth of white slavery was an attempt to re-assert the 'fullness of the community' to shore up faltering certainties, through renaturalisation of their ideological suppositions. This will be demonstrated by an examination of some of the key documents and political events that shaped the white slavery debates in America.

How white was white slavery?

In America, as in Britain, the campaign against white slavery derived much of its rhetorical strength by presenting its fight as one against slavery: borrowing both the language and the sense of moral outrage generated by anti-slavery activism (Irwin 1996, Burton 1994). Jane Addams begins her 1912 polemic against white slavery, *A New Consciousness and an Ancient Evil*, with a chapter entitled 'An Analogy'. The analogy she makes is between 'the social evil' of prostitution and black slavery, and between the work of anti-prostitution groups to those of the American anti-slavery abolitionists:⁶

Those of us who think we discern the beginnings of a new conscience in regard to this twin of slavery, as old and outrageous as slavery itself and even more persistent, find a possible analogy between certain civic, philanthropic and educational efforts directed against the very existence of this social evil and similar organized efforts which preceded the overthrow of slavery in America (p. 4).

But reflected through the mirror of the myth of white slavery, anti-slavery abolitionism came to be inverted, twisted, and distorted, as white women perversely came to occupy the victimised narrative space formerly occupied by the black slave. Here we can posit a second signpost: contemporary anti-trafficking efforts also use the language of slavery, lending urgency and historical significance to their campaigns. And, like the twisted history of the appropriation of black slavery in white slavery narratives, the contemporary twinning of the two has dubious results.

The white slave in American narratives was both literally and metaphorically white. That is, the young, innocent, virgin in the white slavery narratives was most often presented as having white skin (literal meaning). At the same time, her whiteness symbolised her state of unsullied virtue (metaphoric meaning). The symbolic power of whiteness for Americans provided a reading principle (in Laclau's (1997) sense, a recognition that interpellates identity) which was especially potent for white Americans after the dislocations of the civil war: 'The traditional Western connotation that whiteness equals purity and blackness equals depravity flourished in a myth that

⁶ The term 'abolitionist' is confusing, as Josephine Butler adopted the term to refer to her work against the Contagious Diseases Acts. Because the term 'abolitionist' is still used in current debates around prostitution to indicate a certain political position (see One), I will use the tautological phrase 'anti-slavery abolitionists' when referring to campaigns against black slavery.

Draft

appealed to the moral and prurient natures of its audience' (Grittner 1990: 131). In American white slavery narratives, the role of virtue's downfall was very often played by immigrant men and freed male slaves. As 'white slavers', pimps, and clients, 'racially other' men were charged with perpetrating a vast immoral network which threatened not only innocent American girlhood, but the very moral fibre of the nation. This was a perverse inversion of the historical reality of black slavery in America, an attempt to reconfigure its horrifying meaning by recasting the sexual violation of white women at the hands of dark men as 'more terrible than any black slavery that ever existed in this or any other country' (Grittner 1990: 74).⁷

Most historians consider the phrase white slavery to be of little significance in racial terms. Hobson (1987), for example, calls white slavery a 'misrepresentation', as the 'real' traffic also involved Asian and African women, or as she calls it, 'non-white slavery'. This phrase, which has no sort of sexual connotation, or any actual meaning at all, exposes the non-arbitrary nature of the term *white* slavery. In other example, Haag (1999) maintains that white slavery was a 'misnomer' because 'white slavery was not an idea focused principally on the enslavement of *white girls*' (p. 69, emphasis added).⁸ She argues that a number of anti-white slavery reformers were also concerned with the traffic in immigrant women. However, the concern with immigrant women did not negate the racial implications of white slavery. As explored below, immigrant women entered the debate on terms which both contested and re-iterated racial prejudices. It remains the case that white slavery in America could only, and did only, take shape through discursive opposition to black slavery. White slavery was an inherently racist discourse.

Prominent anti-white slavery reformers, such as Roe and Turner, expressly configured their arguments in racial terms.⁹ For example, US District Attorney Edwin W. Sims described the crime as follows: 'The white slave trade may be said to be the business of securing white women and of selling them or exploiting them for immoral purposes' (1910: 14). Sims was highly influential in shaping the public debate on white slavery. The frontispiece of Illinois Vigilance Association Secretary Ernest A. Bell's edited compendium on white slavery *Fighting the Traffic in Young Girls, or, War on The White Slave Trade* (origin of the above quote), has a picture of Sims captioned 'Hon. Edwin W. Sims: The man most feared by all white slave traders'. Along with other Chicago-based activists such as Clifford Roe and Earnest Bell he led sustained campaigns

⁷ This phrase comes from *The Social Evil in Chicago*, the report of the Chicago Vice Commission of 1911, considered by historians to be one of the most influential anti-white slavery documents.

⁸ Though when Haag (1999) deals with other 'tropes of sexual consent and violence', such as interracial marriage and interracial rape, the symbolic power of 'whiteness' in a sexual context is well-recognised and provocatively explored.

⁹ see Grittner (1990).

Draft

against 'vice chiefs' (Grittner 1990), and helped draft the 1910 Mann (White Slave Trade) Act (Grittner 1990: 87). He was much admired by prominent women's rights activists such as Jane Addams (Addams 1911). As Chicago's District Attorney, he prosecuted the majority of the white slavery cases in Chicago. It could thus not be said that his views were inconsequential.

The cause of historians' failure to appreciate the racial significance of 'white' in white slavery is, I believe, a result of a confusion between the literal and the symbolic meaning of white slavery.¹⁰ The correct approach to assessing the significance of 'white' is not to ascertain, like Hobson (1987), whether this misrepresented reality, or, like Haag (1999), the extent of reformers' concern about immigrant women, but to investigate the symbolic power carried by 'white' when linked to 'slavery' in a sexualised context. Whatever the historical circumstances in which the term white slavery came into being, by the time it was picked up by American purity reformers, 'white' was indelibly attached to 'slavery'.¹¹ It gave the concept its meaning; it was not simply an anachronistic hanger-on. It is clear from reading the most influential white slavery narratives, such as those of the Chicago reformers, that 'whiteness' was most often explicitly employed to emphasise the horror of the white slave's fate.

Fear of erosion of racial boundaries

The myth of white slavery embodied the fear of the erosion of racial boundaries, the contamination and eventual disintegration of the illusionary 'wholeness' of the community of white America: whether by freed black slaves or 'dark' foreigners. The fear of the freed slaves and desire to preserve racial boundaries between American whites and blacks was highly evident in the writings of prominent anti-white slave campaigners, such as Samuel Painter Wilson. Wilson's writings, according to Grittner (1990), reached the high point of lurid rhetorical flourish of the group of moral reformers who emerged in Chicago in the first decade of the 19th century. Wilson, in his 1910 narrative of white slavery in Chicago, *Chicago and its Cess-Pools of Infamy*, wrote that compared to white slavers, 'the Congo slave traders of the old days appear like Good Samaritans' (quoted in Grittner 1990: 70) and goes on to describe his experience in Chicago: 'I have heard shrieks and hear cries and groans of agony that have never been surpassed at any public slave auction America has ever witnessed' (in Grittner 1990: 70).

¹⁰ Disturbingly, while decrying the racist elements in white slavery narratives, historians like Hobson (1986), Grittner (1990) and Connelly (1980) themselves all too easily slip into stereotypical thinking where 'non-white slavery' is concerned. While white slavery in its literal meaning is seen as an exaggeration of reality; a distortion of truth; with historical and modern sources interrogated heavily; accounts of the traffic in non-white women, and the involvement of non-white men in this trade, are taken for literal truth. While it is beyond the scope of my research to investigate the 'facts' as presented by Bristow (1977), the uncritical acceptance of the evidence for this trade is distressing.

¹¹ Haag (1999) bolsters her argument for the relative irrelevance of 'white' in white slavery by tracing its first appearance in radical post-bellum thought in the US. Bristow (1997), however, traces the first use of the term to a letter from Victor Hugo in which he used the term to refer to prostitution in an anti-Semitic fashion.

Wilson's narrative presents blacks and foreigners as inter-related threats to American white womanhood. The two played complementary roles:

Wilson's description of the problem made non-WASPs the source of the greatest sexual danger. If the "brutal Russian Jewish whoremonger" was a villain, so were the blacks and Chinese who joined white men in the brothels. The image of "young white girls, huddled in with the worst mob of negroes" gave Wilson his proof that Chicago was fouled by cesspools of immorality (Grittner 1990: 69).

Myth of the black man

The white slave myth also worked through that of another, extremely potent American myth: the black man as brutal and sexually rapacious, as raper of white women (Grittner 1990). The 'social dislocations' of the civil war and the end of slavery were inscribed in mythical tales of black men lying in wait to rape white women. The real effect of these beliefs was a dramatic rise in the lynching of black men in the American South in the 1890s. According to Martha Hodes (1997), while beliefs in black men's super-potent sexuality and sub-human nature were prevalent (indeed a cornerstone of) slavery, it was not until the end of slavery threatened the stability of the dividing lines between white and black, that the myth of the black rapist became so prevalent, with such horrific consequences. The black man's sexual danger was linked to his political threat to the white community, which as Hodes records, was recognised by anti-lynching campaigners Frederick Douglass and Ida B. Wells: Douglass wrote 'It is only since the Negro has become a citizen and a voter...that this charge [of raping white women] has been made' (quoted in Hodes 1997: 6).

As the demise of slavery shook the foundations of white supremacy, 'interracial' sex between black men and white women became the paradigmatic expression of sexual violation. As in Victorian Great Britain, acceptable sexual behaviour was expressed in terms of consent. Sex between a black man and a white woman became that which per definition could not be consented to (Hodes 1997). Sociologist Lester Ward in 1911 stated in his 'four laws of consent' that, 'The women of any race will vehemently reject the men of a race which they regard as lower than their own' (in Haag 1999: 143). Somewhat strangely, the interworking of racialised discourses of citizenship and sexual consent do not figure in Haag's analysis of white slavery, which is limited to shifting notions of the role of the state in labour contracts. However, it is possible to see from the work of other historians the ways in which the victim, who (crucially) played no part in her own downfall, was inscribed with whiteness. By writing her 'slaver' as black/ 'dark', any suggestion of complicity in her own fall was removed.

Draft

White slavery's racialised nexus of sexual innocence and sexual violation was constructed not only through narrative contrast with black men, but also through unwritten opposition to black women – a point barely touched on by historians of white slavery. The white slave's metaphorical shadow was 'coloured'. In discourses of slavery, black women were differently positioned than white women in relation to a notion of consent. While Christian morality frowned on white male sexual license, 'rape' as the possible description of a sexual encounter between a white man and a black woman could not be conceptualised. Not only was she barred from considerations of consent because of her non-human, 'property' status, but black women's sexual nature was considered voracious, indiscriminate and animalistic. Ward's consent laws had their corollary for a sexual relationship between a black woman and a white man: 'The women of any race will freely accept the men of a race which they regard as higher' (in Haag 1999: 143). For many white Americans, including anti-white slavery campaigners, it was unthinkable that a black woman would not consent to sex with a white man: how could a black woman become a 'white slave?'. The absence of mention of American black women in anti-prostitution campaigns or consideration of this gap in historians' account of this time is notable.¹² Where champions of reform twisted and turned over what constituted genuine white slavery as opposed to 'willing prostitution', American black women fell outside this consideration altogether. As Gail Pheterson has examined in *The Whore Stigma* (1986), 'whore', carries specific racial connotation (as does 'pimp'). By virtue of her literal blackness, in the eyes of much of white America, the black woman had no claim to virtue.

White slavery 'worked' as a metaphor because of the connotations of 'whiteness' – purity, innocence and virtue – were juxtaposed in a melodramatic framework with its opposite, 'blackness' – impurity, guilt, and vice (Geertz 1969, Grittner 1990). This opposite was both visible and invisible, present and absent: the melodramatic presence of the black villain/'dark' man, whose darkness was also both literal and symbolic; and the supplementary absence of the

¹² An exception to this general tendency is Jane Addams (1912), who devotes a few pages to investigating the cause of the high number of 'colored' women involved in 'the social evil'. Her work shows that mixture of social progressiveness and conservative morality that characterises her work. On the one hand, including a consideration of black women's work in prostitution in a book on white slavery is highly remarkable. This progressive tendency is also reflected in her targeting of social and economic conditions – slavery and its aftermath – rather than innate tendencies as the cause of black involvement in prostitution. However, while she argues that slavery is to blame for black people's lack of moral restraint, the impression is still one of a group in society whose moral evolution has not reached that of white society:

The community forces the very people who have confessedly the shortest history of social restraint, into a dangerous proximity with the vice districts of the city. This results, as might easily be predicted, in a very large number of colored girls entering a disreputable life...it seems all the more unjustifiable that the nation which is responsible for the broken foundations of this family life should carelessly permit the negroes, making their first struggle towards a higher standard of domesticity, to be subjected to the most flagrant temptations which our civilization tolerates (Addams 1912: 119).

Draft

'dark' woman, whose 'shadiness' was sexually and racially constructed. Thus the white slave was able to mythically exist precisely because she was not a 'black slave'.

Bad girls and 'Bad Niggers': Jack Johnson and the Mann Act

The story of the prosecution of Jack Johnson, a black heavyweight world champion, under the US 1910 White Slave Act (Mann Act), is an example of the narrativisation of 'race'/sex, in which the shape of the 'innocent white slave' is thrown into relief against the blackness of the boxer. Randy Roberts' *Papa Jack: Jack Johnson and the Era of White Hopes* (1983) documents the trial of Johnson under the Act. Roberts' main argument is that Johnson symbolised the threat of disorder whites feared from the de-stabilising of racial boundaries. During his trial, the melodrama of white slavery was actually performed, as Jack Johnson became the living embodiment of the 'white slaver', whose congress with white women had to be punished.

Jack Johnson was a heavyweight boxer from Galveston, Texas, born in 1878. When Johnson began his career in the 1890s, whites and blacks did not fight against each other in heavyweight matches (though black-white fights in the lower-profile lightweight divisions did occur). Why was this the case? To answer that, we have to look at the racial significance that boxing carried at that time in the United States. White Americans saw the dominance of white Americans in the boxing ring as evidence of American superiority: it proved that 'in the social Darwinist sense, Americans were the most fit people in the world' (Roberts 1983: 17). America's boxing chauvinism reveals how nation and race were linked for many white Americans: the American community was white, thus American superiority meant white superiority. Johnson the black fighter possessed American citizenship in name, but he was excluded from the 'real' America, the nation, the community that was white. 'Whites also feared racial unrest in the "unlikely event" that a black fighter should win a fight against a white man' (Roberts 1983).¹³ It was not only a win that was feared: even the sight of a black man and a white one on equal footing in a boxing ring were seen as enough to bring down the walls of racial separation (Roberts 1983).

Until 1908, Johnson fought only other black heavyweights or low-profile white heavyweights; 'white fighters so unimportant that they had no reputations to lose to black boxers' (Roberts 1983: 19). It is today, when heavyweight boxing is so dominated by black men, quite surprising to find out just how threatening Johnson's ring prowess was to white America. When he won the

¹³ White opinion, backed by 'evolutionary' science, was that black fighters, as members of an 'insipient race' were physically and psychologically inferior to whites. While black fighters were widely believed to have harder heads than whites, this was seen as the result of their smaller brain capacity. Blacks were seen as passive, lacking the will to win, shifty, and lazy. This was used to explain white dominance of the sport: when Johnson began to beat white heavyweights, these same inferior characteristics were now used as an explanation of his victories (R. Roberts 1983).

Draft

world championship from white Britain Tommy Burns in 1908, white commentators spoke in apocalyptic tones about the end of Caucasian race dominance. Blacks regarded the victory as a portent of their advance, as the black newspaper the *Richmond Planet* wrote, 'no event in forty years has given more genuine satisfaction to the coloured people of this country than has the signal victory of Jack Johnson' (Roberts 1983: 55). For whites and blacks, Johnson was more than a boxer, and boxing was more than a sport: the boxing ring became the place where the 'race war' was fought.

The sense of white doom at the Burns fight was nothing compared to the devastation caused by Johnson's defeat of the 'Great White Hope': former American heavyweight champion of the world John Jeffries. The fight, in Reno on July 4, 1910, generated intense interest nationwide: Roberts records that 100,000 words per day were sent from Reno in the pre-fight weeks. 'From the very first, it was advertised as a match of civilization and virtue against savagery and baseness' (p. 85). The belief among many whites was that 'race relations remained most stable when blacks remained in their clearly defined, circumscribed place and when there was no nonsense about equality' (p. 110). For whites, a black world champion 'challenged the old notion of the blacks as an inferior race and raised once more the spectre of black rebellion... Johnson was transformed into a racial symbol that threatened America's social order' (p. 110-111).

Not only did Johnson threaten white American manhood in the ring, he compounded the threat by 'poaching on' white American women. Johnson had relationships with a number of white women, all prostitutes, one of whom, Lucy, he married in 1910. He was the black man who beat white men in that most masculine of pursuits – heavyweight boxing – and then 'takes his women'. Johnson menaced not only his white opponents in the ring, but white American manhood and the white American nation. Roberts suggests (following Wiggins 1971) that Johnson was an example of what was then called 'the Bad Nigger': 'a black man who chose a different attitude and station from the ones prescribed by white society' (p. 118). The Bad Nigger was celebrated in African-American folklore, but to white society, he represented the subversion of racial order.

Johnson's threat to the moral and social order was not taken lightly by the government. His deliberate flouting of racial boundaries through his open marriage to a white woman was too provocative to let pass. After one failed attempt to bring Johnson to trial for abducting his wife Lucy (who was incarcerated 'for her own protection' for a number of months), Johnson was brought before a grand jury on white slavery charges regarding a former girlfriend, a white

Draft

prostitute named Belle, in 1912. The 1911 Mann Act was designed to act primarily against domestic white slavery, and forbids the transport of any woman or girl across state lines for 'prostitution, debauchery or any other immoral purpose' (Grittner 1990: 87). Belle, Johnson and a few other prostitutes had traveled together to and from Johnson's fights, living it up in cities like Chicago, New York and Minneapolis. During the trial, the state was unable to prove that Johnson had in any way profited from Belle's prostitution, or that he had 'induced' her to cross state lines. Nonetheless, Johnson was convicted and sentenced to five years in prison.

Roberts argues cogently that the trial was about more than just Johnson's guilt or innocence. Assistant District Attorney Parkin, prosecuting, made this clear in his comments after the verdict was passed:

This verdict...will go around the world. It is the forerunner of laws to be passed in these United States we may live to see-laws forbidding miscegenation. This negro, in the eyes of many, has been persecuted. Perhaps as an individual he was. But it was his misfortune to be the foremost example of the evil permitting the intermarriage of whites and blacks (quoted in Roberts 1983: 177, ellipses in Roberts).¹⁴

Roberts concludes: 'Johnson the symbol had to be punished, even if Johnson the man was technically innocent of violating the Mann Act' (p. 178). In the words of a journalist of the time, Johnson was being 'meted out a terrible punishment for daring to exceed what is considered a Negro's circle of activities' (quoted in Roberts 1983: 178). The KKK capitalised on the result of the trial, attempting to stop Jackson from taking part in a boxing match in Indiana because he was a 'white slaver'. They also used fears of 'white slavery' in their recruitment pamphlets (Blee 1992).

If Johnson was the symbol of transgressive black manhood, what did his counterpart in the actually performed melodrama symbolise? This is a question that Roberts does not explore. Both Lucy, Johnson's wife, and Belle, his girlfriend, were prostitutes who had already worked for a number of years before he met them. It was impossible to portray them as betrayed innocents in the court proceedings. However, this did not matter to the outcome of the trial: Judge Carpenter, in his instructions to the jury, stated: 'The law does not apply solely to innocent girls. It is quite as much an offence against the Mann Act to transport a hardened, lost prostitute as it would be to transport a young girl, a virgin' (quoted in Roberts 1983: 177).

While this is technically true, it is a curious statement for the time, highly out of keeping with the tone of the most strident advocates of the White Slavery Act, who made much of the innocence of the girls, and the deception and violence needed to accomplish their ruin (see Connelly 1980:

¹⁴ Parkin was a prominent anti-white slavery campaigner, who contributed several chapters to Bell's *The War on White Slavery* (1910). These chapters, however, give little indication of his virulent racism.

Draft

128).¹⁵ In most cases, an 'immoral' woman did not have the sympathy of the public, and was not likely to be believed in court. White slavery reformer Charles Nelson Crittenton decried a Missouri law that declared that 'a woman of immoral life was debarred from giving testimony in the courts of that state, as the fact of her immorality prevented her from being a credible witness' (Crittenton 1910: 135).¹⁶ Yet, in the trial, Belle's immorality was rubbed out by the colour of her white skin. Her whiteness was enough to convince the jury of Johnson's guilt. Though a 'hardened prostitute', she symbolised the purity of white womanhood that needed to be avenged: through Johnson's blackness, she was transformed into a piteous white slave. It is a horrible irony that Johnson, whose parents were slaves, was himself convicted of being a slaver in the acting out of this perverse melodrama.

That white slavery was the axe that felled Johnson could not be more significant. Progressive reformers had prize fighting down on their list of societal ills: like drinking, gambling, and prostitution, high-minded concern with social welfare went hand in hand with repressive moralism. Roberts records that Progressive reformers considered prize fighting to be un-American, 'prize fighting, they argued, was as alien to those [traditional, rural American] values as an illiterate Jewish immigrant from Russia' (p. 93). Prize fighting was 'an immigrant sport that attracted Irish and Polish Catholics, Russian Jews, and other undesirable sorts'(p.93). It is striking how similar these sentiments are to those linking immigration to prostitution through the trope of white slavery. Johnson's role in the melodrama of white slavery illustrates perfectly the fear of disorder expressed in the myth. Johnson himself symbolised many of the anxieties of the Progressive era. Johnson was a symbol squared: all of his attributes and characteristics worked together to amplify the symbolic significance: the black man, the black boxer, the lover of white women: disorder upon chaos upon dissolution and devastation. As Roberts records: 'He embodied the white man's nightmare of racial chaos' (p. 6).

¹⁵ Grittner (1990) includes a quote to the US legislature from Representative Gordon Russel of Texas, a fervent advocate of the Mann Act: 'Let me tell you gentlemen, no nation can rise higher than the estimate which it places upon the virtue and purity its womanhood'. After struggling to end the slavery of "the black man" could Congress do no less than help 'abolish the slavery of white women. This bill is a tribute to every pure and good woman in this land' (p. 83). Grittner observes that,

Russell's heavy-handed linking of white women and black men was aimed at his fellow Southerners. A vote against the Mann Act could be interpreted back home as a failure to prevent miscegenation and as an incitement to black men. The debate occurred at a significant time in the South, when the Jim Crow laws [legal segregation] were firmly in place and the white communities were still filled with sexual fears about black men (p. 95).

¹⁶ This was again an anomaly: Grittner (1990) records that sentences under the Mann Act were lighter when the woman was already a prostitute.

Draft

Immigration and white slavery

Haag (1999) and Hobson (1987) are partially correct in their observations about the concern of campaigners for 'non-white' women involved in the trade. Immigrant women did feature in many campaigns around white slavery. As with other symbolic placings in the myth, the immigrant woman took up an ambiguous, even paradoxical, position. On the one hand, the immigrant woman's plight was seen as the result of the backwardness of their own culture, and the failure of immigrants to successfully adopt or adapt to American 'civilisation'. On the other, the helpless immigrant girl served as a powerful symbol of outrage for campaigners against the low wages and poor living conditions of immigrants. The mythical tide of immigrant prostitution was used both by those who championed the cause of immigrants, and those who sought to keep them out.

The nature of immigration to America changed dramatically in the Progressive years. Whereas 19th century immigration was mostly from Northern Europe and Scandinavia, the new century saw the arrival of increasing numbers of Southern Europeans, Russians, and the Austro-Hungarian empire. Connelly calls the arrival of 'over thirteen million immigrants' between 1900 and 1914 'one of the most profound social and demographic transformations in American history' (p. 48). These changes inspired a range of reactions across the spectrum of American politics. Haag divides these reactions into two principal camps: 'one that espoused a romantic-racial "uplift" of the immigrant to citizenship and another that endorsed the exclusion of "savage" races' (p. 95): or, an 'assimilationist' and a 'eugenicist' tendency. The official and public reaction to white slavery took shape in conversation with both of these tendencies. These tendencies still prevail in much discussion of migration today, and hence we can put down another signpost here: the supposed threat to the nation by immigrants is one of the most potent aspects of the contemporary trafficking myth.

According to Grittner (1990), vice reform in America did not really catch fire until the myth of white slavery turned the blame for America's moral downfall onto a network of immigrants engaged in the traffic in women. 'Muckraking' journalist George Kibbe Turner was a key figure in setting up this interpretive framework, which was judicially fixed in the US Immigration Act of 1910 and the 1910 White Slave (Mann) Act (Connelly 1980, Grittner 1990). In two articles in McClure's Magazine (G. K. Turner 1907, 1909) he linked corruption in city politics in Chicago and New York to a network of foreigners, primarily Jews, whose nefarious deals included white slavery. Turner was successful in arousing mass concern for the issue of white slavery through combining it with other Progressive concerns: 'By nimble transpositions Turner placed virtually

Draft

all aspects of urban corruption and political chicanery that interested middle-class, Progressive reformers in conversation with one another through the interlocutor of white slavery' (Haag 1999: 68).

Anti-Semitism was a common theme in anti-white slavery tracts, reflecting the Anti-Semitism that was prevalent in the Progressive years. According to Connelly (1980), George Kibbe Turner 'expressed most fully' the anti-Semitic outlook, detailing 'the cabalistic machinations of the caftan-cloaked latter-day Shylocks...without documentation or the mention of sources' (p. 62). His report on Chicago blamed Russian Jews for supplying women for prostitution in Chicago (Turner 1907). *Daughters of the Poor*, his 1909 article on New York, allegedly uncovered the links between international Jewish white slavery rings and corruption in New York's Tammany Hall, centre of the Democratic Government of the city and a by-word for political corruption. When railing against the spread throughout the country of New York Jewish 'cadets' (young men, connected to Tammany Hall, who supposedly lured young women into white slavery), he evokes with chilling prescience images of insects or rats who needed to be exterminated: 'To-day they are strong in all the greater cities, they swarm at the gateway of the Alaskan frontier at Seattle; they infest the streets and restaurants of Boston; they flock for the winter to New Orleans...they abound in South and Southwest, and in the mining regions of the West' (p.52). This statement plays on the well-known anti-Semitic sentiment of the Jew as pollutant, spreading his pestilence from the already corrupt New York throughout the rest of America. This anti-Semitism, 'the myth of a national Jewish conspiracy' (Grittner 1990: 90) was pervasive in the US Immigration Commission Report of 1909 (U.S. Senate 1909), which served as a basis for the 1910 Immigration Act severely restricting immigration to the United States.¹⁷

Grittner (1990) claims that one of the effects of Turner's work was to cement the perception of the immigrant man as the white slaver, with the innocent American woman his helpless victim: 'Native-born women, not immigrant women, were presented as the chief victims. The alien man assumed the role of villain' (p. 63). While my reading of Turner supports Grittner's claim about immigrant men, I disagree about the victims of white slavery. In Turner's anti-Tammany hall diatribe, Jewish white slavers, and to a much lesser extent, Polish and French traders, preyed nearly exclusively on women of their own nationality or ethnicity: 'The victim of the cadet is usually a young girl of foreign birth, who knows little or nothing of the conditions of American life' (G.K. Turner 1909: 49).

¹⁷ The Jewish community was very sensitive to accusations of white slavery, and Jewish organisations were at the forefront of anti-white slavery efforts. See Bristow 1982.

Beautiful, young, and innocent: poor little girl in the big bad city

white slavery is an existing condition – a system of girl hunting that is national and international in its scope, that...literally consumes thousands of girls – Clean, innocent girls, every year; that...is operated with a cruelty, a barbarism that gives a new meaning to the word fiend; that...is an imminent peril to every girl in the country who has a desire to get into the city and taste its excitements and its pleasures (Sims 1910a: 5).

Turner was convinced that immigrant Jewish girls from New York were the major source of prostitutes throughout the US:

the East Side of New York, which has now grown, under this development, to be the chief recruiting-ground for the so-called white slave trade in the United States, and probably in the world. It can be exploited, of course, because in it lies the newest body of immigrants and the greatest supply of unprotected young girls in the city (1909: 54).

Others, such as Chicago District Attorney Sims, were convinced that the number of foreign girls were a 'mere fraction' of the number of American girls involved in the trade. Thus, while the immigrant girl was the focus of concern, many were also concerned with that 'flower of American womanhood': the country girl. White slavery narratives, such as those by Sims, are full of dire warnings to parents of the dangers of the city for young, innocent girls fresh from the country:

literally thousands of innocent girls from the country districts are every year entrapped into a life of hopeless slavery and degradation because parents in the country do not understand conditions as they exist and how to protect their daughters from the "white slave" traders who have reduced the art of ruining young girls to a national and international system (Sims 1910c: 48).

The fate of the white slave in the city carried metaphorical resonance in a number of directions. As Connelly (1980) describes it, white slavery, the corruption of the innocent American girl, came to symbolise the demise of rural America, all that was 'pure and innocent' in America.¹⁸ In many narratives, the city was portrayed as a place where foreign white slavers lay in wait for the innocent American girl. Sims (1910b) describes the dangers of the ice cream parlour:

a spider's web for her entanglement. This is especially true of those ice cream saloons and fruit stores kept by foreigners...I believe that there are good grounds for the suspicion that the ice cream parlor, kept by the foreigner in the large country town, is often a recruiting station and a feeder for the "white slave" traffic (p. 71).

He claims that foreign proprietors of ice-cream parlours have a kind of 'free-masonry' among them, so they can 'pass girls along'. Sims concludes that 'the best and the surest way for parents of girls in the country to protect them from the clutches of the "white slaver" is to keep them in the country' (p. 71).

¹⁸ Connelly's (1980) reading of the narrative of 'The true story of Estelle Ramon of Kentucky', included in Bell's *Fighting the Traffic in Young Girls* (1910), explores the metaphorical resonances of the 'country girl in the city'.

Draft

Connelly (1980) writes that the foreign white slaver 'assumed the role formerly occupied by the Indian' (p. 84) in the one of the literary precursors of the American white slavery myth: Indian captivity stories. He argues that,

This depiction of the white slavers served several functions' it is psychologically easier to hate someone if they were racially 'other', but on a deeper level, it was the 'projection of native America's deepest sexual fear: immigrant males possessing the daughters of the land while their men stand unable to help or protect (p.85).

Sim's use of a 'little red riding hood' metaphor: 'their warfare upon virtue is as persistent, as calculating, and as unceasing as was the warfare of the wolf upon the unprotected lamb of the pioneer folk in the early days of the Western frontier' (1910b: 68) exposes its meaning when seen in the light of Connelly's suggestion that the white slave metaphorically represented 'virgin' American territory.¹⁹

However, while I agree with Connelly in this interpretation, I do feel that it limits the various meaning that the simple melodramatic theme of 'young girl in the big city' had for its various audiences. It was not only American country girls who met fates as 'white slaves: the worse fate that can befall a woman' (1910b: 68) in the big bad city. Newly arrived immigrant girls were also seen as likely to meet their downfall in the urban mire. The country girl and the newly arrived immigrant shared the narrative characteristics of youth, beauty, innocence, mobility, and a lack of parental supervision.

'Innocence lured, betrayed, destroyed': (paradise lost)

The stress on the beauty of the victim is a common feature of white slavery narratives. These physical descriptions function both as a mildly salacious stimulant and to provide narrative contrast with the tragic, wasted figure at the end of the tale: as in a fairy tale, goodness is associated with beauty and ugliness with evil and immorality.²⁰ Sims (1910b) describes a country girl returned home by Ernest A. Bell of the Illinois Vigilance Association:

They, however, welcomed a very different person from the pretty girl who went out from that home to make her way in the big city. She was pitifully wasted by the life which she had led, and her constitution is so broken down that she cannot reasonably expect many years of life, even under the tenderest care. What is still worse, the fact

¹⁹ Sims (1910) is very fond of the wolf and lamb metaphor, an example of the fairy-tale influences on the white slave melodrama genre.

²⁰ A notable exception to the narrative equation between beauty and virtue is provided by Ophelia Amigh, Superintendent of the Illinois Training School for Girls (a reformatory). She recounts the story of Nellie, 'a very ordinary looking girl and below the average of intelligence, but as tractable and obedient as she is ingenuous. She is wholly without the charm which would naturally attract the eye of the white slave trader' (1910: 123). Nellie's obedient nature meant she was allowed to leave the 'Training School for Girls' and take up work as a housemaid. From here the story follows familiar paths, and Nellie ends up in a Chicago house of shame: 'How she was found and rescued is a story quite apart from the purpose which has led me to tell of this incident – that of indicating how tightly the slave traders have their nets spread for even the most ordinary and unattractive prey. They let no girl escape who they dare to approach! (1910: 123).

Draft

cannot be denied that her moral fibre is shattered and the work of reclamation must be more than physical (p. 67).

Bell, with the lush rhetoric common to many white slavery narratives, contributes a story to the same volume:

These murderous traffickers drink the heart's blood of weeping mothers while they eat the flesh of their daughters, by living and fattening themselves on the destruction of the girls. Disease and debauch quickly blast the beauty of these lovely victims. Cannibals seem almost merciful in comparison with the white slavers, who murder the girls by inches (1910a: 75).

Often, the beautiful innocent pays with her life: racked with disease (assumed to be syphilis, but rarely mentioned by name), she decies from her hospital bed her slaver and praises the good reformer who tells her tale.²¹ A photographs series in Bell's *Fighting the Traffic* (E. A. Bell 1910b) illustrates perfectly the 'Harlot's Progress' from innocence, through ruin, to death. The captions in the text itself describe the first two photos: 'Daisy at fourteen', above a photo of 'Daisy at seventeen "Young and so Fair"' with these words underneath: 'The top picture shows a pure, winsome girl of fourteen going to school in a little country town. The bottom one is the same girl who left her home town to take a position in the city. The man she trusted deceived her' (photo next to p. 99). The next photo in the series shows a cropped-headed girl in an institutional bed, with the caption: 'Daisy under twenty, dying in the poor-house. Less than three years after leaving her home she was found in the poor-house, forgotten by (sic) and friends, and dying of a loathsome disease' (photo next to p. 146). The next photo shows a funeral carriage on the street: 'Daisy's lonely funeral paid for by charity. The charity nurses took up a subscription and saved her from the potter's field. No flowers. No friends. No relatives. Only the undertaker and his assistants' (photo next to p. 147).

The horror and titillation of white slave narratives was magnified by stressing the youth of the victim. Youth and beauty combined to produce a delectably innocent victim. Bell (E. A. Bell 1910a) recounts the story of a white slave rescued in Chicago from the 'den' of the 'notorious French trader and his wife, Alphonse and Eva Dufour (p. 75):

In this glittering den, with its walls and ceiling of mirrors, was a sweet Russian girls, perhaps sixteen years old, whose fate made my heart bleed. She was of the best Russian type, blonde, of medium height, peach-blossom complexion, roundish, and of exceedingly gentle and loving disposition (p. 75).

This lingering description links racial stereotypes to beauty and sexual attractiveness, as does Sims (1910b) in his tale of 'a little Italian peasant girl':

²¹ Disease, especially syphilis, was a power metaphor in its own right. The diseased body of the prostitute symbolised the contagion of society (Walkowitz 1980, Bell 1994, Nead 1988).

Draft

At this time she was about sixteen years old, innocent and rarely attractive for a girls of her class, having the large, handsome eyes, the black hair and the rich olive skin of a typical Italian (p. 55). This 'pretty victim's' loss of virtue is paralleled by her violent disfigurement: in an attempt to escape she is slashed with a razor that disfigures her completely so that 'to look upon her is to shudder' (p. 56).

Sims tells the above tale as if he had personally met the girl and heard her story (which would make it impossible to know she was once pretty), a typical narrative device in the white slavery stories, lending authenticity to the melodrama. Even more 'authentic' are the first-person tales from the 'victims' themselves, such as 'A White Slave's Own Story', a letter supposedly written to Earnest A. Bell from a victim of the French traders. The letter begins with a description of the victims: 'Here we were, always from fifteen to eighteen girls, most of us very young' (p. 77) traces their fate, and ends with expressions of gratitude to the good men who saved them:

Some one ought to do his duty and make war on those horrid men. They simply take girls for their slaves in all the country. For even if we are weak, some one with courage ought to help us not to be persuaded by those men. I am certainly glad that all the men are not bad, that some one (sic) takes our part. You can be sure that most of the girls are happy that some one came to make us strong (E. A. Bell 1910a: 78).

It was by no means only men who lingered on the youth and beauty of the victim, Florence Mabel Dedrick, a rescue worker in Chicago, wrote:

One father, not long ago, after some striking warnings, wrote saying he had been aroused to inquire after his little girl, her letters had been more and more infrequent...When rescued, it was a girl with a blighted, pitifully wasted life, a sad return, indeed, to the old home. Once a pretty pure, innocent girl. I find a majority of girls gone astray are from the county towns, villages and hamlets. There is need for the small communities to awake (Dedrick 1910).

The Minataur's labyrinth

In white slavery narratives, as shown in three, the moral geography of the city was hazardous for the young girl, and the places that might lead to her irredeemable loss very numerous. A drawing in *Fighting the Traffic in Young Girls* (E. A. Bell 1910b) shows the blazing door of a dance-hall, with a young women poised outside. It is captioned,

Dangerous amusements – the brilliant entrance to hell itself. Young girls who have danced at home a little are attracted by the blazing lights, gaiety and apparent happiness of the "dance halls," which in many instances leads to their downfall (across from p. 35). Other 'dangerous amusements' that parents are urged to be continually on guard against include 'five-cent theatres', amusement parks, and 'restaurants selling wines and liquors where many young girls go as waitresses, which hold dangers for any girl' (Dedrick 1910: 11) and of course the foreign-run ice cream parlour and fruit store. Clifford Roe warned that,

Draft

so many and varied are the ways of procuring girls that it is quite impossible to tell all of them...Schools for manicuring, houses for vapor and electric baths, large steamboats running between the city and summer resorts, amusement parks, the nickel theaters, the rooms in the depots and stores are all haunts and procuring places for the white slave traders (1910: 173).

In white slavery stories, the American countryside and the foreign land both figured as a sort of pre-lapsarian rural idyll, a garden of Eden whose expulsion is guaranteed by the serpent of sexual knowledge. Often, the tales have the 'serpent' himself visiting the garden to tempt the innocent young beauty with the apple of an easy life and pretty clothes. In other tales, such as that of that of Sims' 'little Italian peasant girl', the tempter is a woman:

'A "fine lady" who wore beautiful clothes came to her where she lived with her parents, made friends with her, told her she was uncommonly pretty (the truth, by the way), and professed a great interest in her.²² Such flattering attentions from an American lady who wore clothes as fine as those of the Italian nobility could have but one effect on the mind of this simple little peasant girl and on her still simpler parents. Their heads were completely turned and they regarded the "American lady" with almost adoration' (1910: 54).

In these stories, a complicated tale of American pride and American shame is being told. The 'American lady' is presented in sharp contrast to the backward peasants, and 'free America' is seen as the quite natural desire of any foreign girl. On the other hand, this innocence is destroyed once it reaches the promised land, as America fails to live up to her promise:

What mockery it is to have in our harbor in New York the statue of Liberty with outstretched arms welcoming the foreign girl to the land of the free!...What a travesty to wrap the flag of America around our girls and extol virtue and purity, freedom and liberty, and then not raise a hand to protect our own girls who are being procured by white slave traders every day! (Roe 1910: 153).

Other tales of foreign girls in peril focus on the debased cultural practices of other countries, exhorting foreigners to reach American standards and decrying Americans who themselves fail to uphold American values. Even if the immigrant woman in a narrative lacked the literal whiteness of skin, she still partook of symbolic whiteness: partially through her child-like sexual innocence, but most significantly, by her positioning opposite the 'dark' slave trader.

There is no more depraved class of people in the world than those human vultures who fatten on the shame of innocent young girls. Many of these white slave traders are recruited from the scum of the criminal classes of Europe. And in this lies the revolting

²² As I indicated when this story is first mentioned above, Sims is carried on the wave of rhetorical enthusiasm to the point of narrative unreliability. As the story is recounted, the 'little Italian peasant girl' is telling her tale to sympathetic listeners, including Assistant US District Attorney Parkin, the prosecutor in the Jack Johnson case who hoped Johnson's conviction would lead to laws against miscegenation. The 'little Italian peasant', arrested in the Chicago brothel raids due to enforcement of the 1907 Immigration Act, at first, 'like most of the others taken in the raids, stoutly maintained that ...she was in a life of shame from choice and not through the criminal act of any person' (p. 54). However, after being interrogated and persuaded of the good intentions of Parkins and company, she 'broke down and with pitiful sobs related her awful narrative. That every word of it was true no one could doubt who saw her as she told it' (p. 54). Descriptions of her beauty from the standpoint of Sims who 'saw her as she told it' provide a fine narrative contrast with her horrible disfigurement later on.

Draft

side of the situation. On the one hand the victims, pure, innocent, unsuspecting, trusting young girls – not a few of them mere children. On the other hand, the white slave trader, low, vile, depraved and cunning – organically a criminal (1910a: 16).

The foreign white slave trader is one so foul that he would not hesitate to apprehend and ruin women of his own ‘race’:

The immigrant girl is thus exposed to dangers at the very moment when she is least able to defend herself. Such a girl, already bewildered by the change from an old world village to an American city... Those discouraged and deserted (by lovers) girls become an easy prey for the procurers who have sometimes been in league with their lovers (Addams 1912: 28).

The discourse of the oppression of immigrant women by immigrant men was linked to notions of citizenship in narratives of immigrant prostitution and concurrent concerns about fraudulent, ‘forced’ marriage (Haag 1999). Between men and women of the same ‘lower race’, tales of sexual coercion re-affirmed of superior morals of the white American, *national* community.

Feminism and white slavery in America

As in Britain, feminists were a major force in the campaigns against prostitution in turn of the century America, including in anti white-slavery campaigns. Feminists, too, took up the anti-corruption line in campaigns against prostitution and campaigns for political enfranchisement. As in England, female sexual purity was translated into a higher moral sensibility in all things, including politics. Women’s ‘good housekeeping’ was needed to clean up the corruption in city, state, and national government. Paradoxically, women’s entrance into the public sphere was predicated on the presumed moral conditions that kept her confined to home and hearth in the first place (Elshtain 1974).

Feminists in America displayed the same ambiguous relationship with the figure of the prostitute as did British and Continental feminists. A curious phrase from the inaugural resolution of the New York Female Moral Reform Society; one of the first female anti-vice societies, and dedicated to converting prostitutes and closing brothels in New York City, encapsulates this ambivalence: ‘Resolved, That the licentious man is no less guilty than his victim’ (Smith-Rosenberg 1985: 112). The notion of a ‘guilty victim’, oxymoronic as it may sound to our ears, expresses perfectly how feminists (and others) struggled to harmonize their moral impulse to condemn a woman’s loss of virtue with sympathy for her fall, as well as a desire to make men share the guilt. The ambiguities in the feminist relationship to prostitutes reflected tensions in Progressive ideology itself. Feminist desire to protect vulnerable girls – primarily working class and immigrant – took shape through a disciplinary desire to control ‘wild’ tendencies. Desire to achieve equality for women partook of notions of women’s moral superiority. The work of women’s groups and prominent female campaigners highlights most starkly the contradictory

Draft

tendencies in anti white-slavery campaigns. These ambiguities in the feminist response to prostitution persist in contemporary anti-trafficking efforts, with feminists calls for protection of young women often voiced in terms of disciplinary actions.

This ambiguity is clearly illustrated in the work of the notable US feminist campaigner, Jane Addams. In her 1912 book on white slavery, *A New Conscience and an Ancient Evil*, Addams argues forcefully against police harassment of prostitutes and for improved wages for working women. While she relates with heart-rending pathos the stories of poor girls whose only hope of feeding their families is by giving in to the blandishments of wicked men, she is scornful and dismissive of those girls who would contemplate selling their virtue in slightly less desperate circumstances:

Although economic pressure as a reason for entering an illicit life has thus been brought out in court by the evidence in a surprising number of cases, there is no doubt that it is often exaggerated; a girl always prefers to think that economic pressure is the reason for her downfall, even when the immediate causes have been her love of pleasure, her desire for finery, or the influence of evil companions (pp. 47, 60).

According to Addams, these moral failings supposedly made young working-class and immigrant girls 'easy prey' for white slavers. What is certain is that belief in these girls' innate moral weakness made them the ideal target for the reforming impulses of middle-class feminists.

In Four, I described how Walkowitz (1992) shows how Josephine Butler cast herself as the loving and castigating Christian mother in the feminist melodrama of white slavery. American 'rescue work' in prostitution was historically both Christian and female: 'women ministering to women' was one of the few fitting activities for women in the Church' (Smith-Rosenberg 1985: 72). In their writings, American Christian women tended to allocate themselves roles as melodramatic heroines, gently but firmly taming the wild chaotic girl to adopt the meek and grateful posture befitting her age and sex (Smith-Rosenberg 1985). A common referent in American white slavery narratives, but especially those written by women, is the Mother: her failure to protect her daughter must be compensated for by the intervention of mother-figure rescue workers. This is illustrated in a story by Chicago rescue missionary Florence Mabel Dedrick:

The danger begins the moment a girl leaves the protection of Home and Mother. One of these dangers, and the one that seems to be well nigh impossible for parents to realize, is the fact that there are watchers or agents, who may be either men or women, at our steamboat landings, railroad stations, everywhere, who seek attractive girls evidently unused to city ways, try to make their acquaintance, using inducements and deception of every conceivable kind, offers of helpfulness, showing her every kindness. I remember so well one dear girl whom I found in Cook country Hospital, brought there from a brothel, sold, led away, deceived, from another town, on the promise of work, who said to me, "Every one in Chicago deceives you. No one told me the truth until I met you. You are the first real friend I could trust" (1910: 109).

Draft

Mothers are exhorted to protect their daughters by Ophelia Amigh, Superintendent of the Illinois Training School for Girls:

As one whose daily duty it is to deal with wayward and fallen girls, as one who has had to dig down into the sordid and revolting details of thousands of these sad cases...let me say to such mothers: In this day and age of the world no young girl is safe! And all the young girls who are not surrounded by the alert, constant and intelligent protection of those who love them unselfishly are in imminent and deadly peril. And the more beautiful and attractive they are the greater is their peril! (1910: 119).

It is easy to see why anti-prostitution was such a potent symbol for early feminists and female reformers. What more powerful way of denouncing a range of conditions that effected women, the poor, children, immigrants than by connecting them with prostitution? The prostitute could embody, not just a range of repressive anxieties, but progressive ones as well. Prostitution and the harlot's miserable end represented the ultimate horror that resulted from a range of social ills that feminists were fighting against. What better way to decry the low wages paid to women than with a story of a poor girl lured into degradation with oily promises of an easy life and beautiful clothes? There was the department store – the symbol of the new urban marketplace – with, on the one hand, all the consumer goods that young women desired, on the other, their own low-paid position. What better way to argue against slum living for the poor than to link these conditions to prostitution? Jane Addams argues that slum overcrowding breaks down natural modesty of little girls, making it easier for them to go with 'bad men'. What better way to condemn child labour than through the pitiful figure of the sexually enslaved girl-child? How better to illustrate the need for the integration of immigrants – or to close borders to them – than through the figure of the naïve immigrant girls, tricked by her own countryman into marriage, and then deserted and degraded?

In conversations with racialised discourses of the American nation, white slavery fears fostered a range of feminist positions, some of which advocated eugenicist strategies for achieving racial purity and feminine equality. Feminist-produced white slavery campaigns and narratives never carried simply one message: often, they were 'an uneasy admixture of progressive opinion and eugenicist principle' (Beer and Joslin 1999: 15). Beer and Joslin (1999) compare the work of Jane Addams with that of her friend Charlotte Perkins Gilman to illustrate these conflicts in feminist politics.

While Addam's reforming work was concerned with the need to integrate immigrants, and to bring them up to an American standard of morality, Gilman believed that moral purity was linked genetically with race (Gilman 1991). Gilman combined her view of women's role as guardians of

Draft

the species through the political space of their wombs with a condemnation of the system of women's economic independence. Gilman's work, (as looked at by Beer and Joslin) is a fine illustration of the way in which women created Laclau's necessary but impossible 'fullness of the community' through invocation of the white slavery myth. In Gilman's story *His Mother* (1981), the standard figures of white slavery this time enact a eugenics morality play: 'Gilman's message is clear: the body politic will be cleansed of its perversions and distortions if women can refuse complicity in the accepted nexus of duty and sexual dependence and reconfigure it so as to put the species above the individual' (Beer and Joslin 1999: 15).

Commercialisation: 'The rise of the pimp system'

Hand in hand with a belief about the rise of the immigrant controlled 'vice trust' went beliefs in the increased commercialisation of prostitution. This belief was an article of faith in white slavery stories, mirrored in contemporary discourses of 'nets' and 'rings' of immigrant-controlled organised crime: the 'Yakuzas', 'Triads' and mafias. The commercialisation of contemporary prostitution is an ideological motif that serves any number of causes; from anti-globalisation advocates who point to it as the most egregious example of the excesses of global capitalism, to American hawks who use it to justify America's 'war on terror'.

Hobson (1987) provides a good example of the belief in the increased commercialisation of prostitution in the Progressive period. In this, she takes issue with the approach to white slavery as a metaphor, as a 'psychological clearinghouse for a host of social disorders' (p. 140).²³ While citing Connelly as the most 'coherent and subtle' (p. 140) practitioner of this approach, she still indicts him for failing to take sufficient account of campaigners' concern with the 'reality' of prostitution. Hobson's position is that white slavery discourses reflected real changes in the prostitution economy. Chief among these changes, according to Hobson, was the loss of control of the prostitution economy by women, or what she terms 'the rise of the pimp system' (p. 139). What were the characteristics of the 'pimp system' identified by Hobson? This rise involved a number of changes, most linked to the assumed growing commercialisation of prostitution. According to this conception, prostitution was becoming 'more rationalised and organised' (p. 139), the role of middlemen was increasing, and there was a 'greater division of labour' which encompassed 'proprietors, pimps, madams, runners, collectors...doctors, clothing dealers, and professional bondsmen' (p. 139). As a result of this deep commercialisation, women were supposedly less able to work independently: 'Whereas in the past prostitutes had had bully boys or lovers who often exploited them, by the turn of the century more and more prostitutes' labor

²³ The term 'psychological clearinghouse' is Connelly's own (1980: 7).

Draft

and wages were actively managed by pimps, who in some cases arranged clients or installed women in particular brothels' (p. 143).

Comparing Connelly (1980) and Hobson's (1987) different interpretation of the matter of 'the rise of the pimp system' is a good way of examining how myths around prostitution can retain their performativity long after the social context in which they were active has changed. It is worthwhile to linger here, for assertions about the growing horrors of pimping are a staple feature of anti-prostitution campaigns to this day. First, Hobson overemphasises the symbolic dimension in Connelly's view of anti-prostitution. Though he sees anti-prostitution as a metaphoric response to various social anxieties, he does not consider prostitution itself to be 'red herring': 'The grim reality of the vice districts and of streetwalkers plying their trade along the thoroughfares was the immediate occasion of the progressive concern over prostitution, and this study is in no way intended to minimize that basic truth' (p. 6). Most interesting, however, is that Connelly's 'psychological' approach to a seminal white slavery document, the Chicago Vice Commission Report (1911) exposes the 'rise of the pimp system' as a potent myth in itself.²⁴

The increasing control of prostitution by pimps was an essential element, and an article of faith, in anti-prostitution and anti-white slavery campaigns. Connelly (1980) notes the concern with commercialisation in the 1911 Chicago Vice Commission report, *The Social Evil in Chicago*: 'The first truth...is that fact that prostitution in this city is a *Commercialized Business* of large proportions with tremendous profits of more than Fifteen Million Dollars per year, controlled largely by men, not women' (p. 32, emphasis in original). Clifford Roe argued that 'The power of free enterprise and competition had even reached the vice industry as cheaper sources of supplying women became widespread' (quoted in Grittner 1990: 67). For Connelly, this 'ominous' discovery was a symbol and symptom of other anxieties during the Progressive years: the corruption of the 'evil city', the supposed fear of underground criminal networks controlled by immigrants (vice-trusts) and the social dislocation during the Progressive years due to the spread of factory labour and the consequent process of reification and alienation.²⁵

²⁴ This belief in 'the rise of the pimp system' is still extremely prevalent and powerful today. Many sex worker activists oppose the use of the term 'pimp'. Laws aimed to 'stop pimping' have routinely been turned against sex workers, their lovers, business managers, and families. Stereotypes about the relationships between pimps and prostitutes perpetuate the passive, damaged image of female sexuality and pathologise sex workers' intimate relationships. Furthermore, the 'pimp' image in the US and in Britain is constructed through racist notions about the brutality and hypersexuality of black men. See Pheterson 1987 and the articles about pimping at the NSWSP website, www.nswsp.org.

²⁵ See Stange (1998) for analysis of the theme of labour power, commodity exchange, and white slavery.

Draft

One key difference between Hobson and Connelly is in their evaluation of source material. Connelly recognises that 'The voice speaking in *The Social Evil in Chicago* was...the voice of specific, identifiable, powerful and established groups in Chicago' (p. 99). He notes that there were no representatives of prostitutes on the commission, the group 'which might have been the most knowledgeable about prostitution in the city...[it] was, thus, the *official* version of prostitution in Chicago in the early twentieth century. This does not in any sense make it a less important source; it simply makes it a certain kind of source, a qualification of no mean importance'(p. 99, emphasis added). It is precisely this recognition of the location of the authority contained in the Commission's report that is missing in Hobson. 'The rise of the pimp system', according to Hobson, 'was documented in nearly every study of prostitution during this period' (p. 143). But what exactly were the nature of these studies? She relies heavily on the Chicago Vice Commission Report and her main sources include Clifford Roe, a key member of the Chicago Commission, whose manipulation of evidence was so blatant that it was marked even by his contemporaries in the anti-prostitution movement (Connelly 1980). Hobson casts no critical eye on these materials, and as a result, her analysis reflects the assumptions and anxieties of those whose material she uses, rather than a critical evaluation of them.

The lack of critical evaluation is especially striking in light of Hobson's close reading of other 'factual' accounts of the day, such as social workers' and doctors' evaluations of prostitutes, and testifies to the strength of the belief that prostitution is controlled by pimps. While Hobson is most keen to stress the 'real', rather than the symbolic, nature of anti-prostitution campaigns, she nonetheless acknowledges that there was a 'symbolic content' to the campaign, 'particularly in its obsession with the white slave trade....White slavery as a metaphor captured a prostitute's growing dependence on a manager/pimp and her loss of the freedom to move in and out of prostitution-to work part time or seasonally' (p. 141,144). In her attempt to re-suture the gap between 'actual conditions in prostitution' and campaigner's concerns in white slavery, however, she takes the 'rise of the pimp system' as the actual real 'event' that white slavery reflected, rather than seeing both the rise of the pimp and the fear of white slavery as two aspects of the same myth.²⁶

Metaphor and myth redux

Throughout the above examination of the American genealogy of white slavery, I have signposted the links to today's trafficking debates. I have explored white slavery at such length so

²⁶ The image of 'the vice trust' was an analogy to other, corporate trusts, which were linked to graft and corruption in the city. While Hobson unquestioningly accepts the myth of 'the rise of the pimp system', she does contest the interpretation of it as a 'vice trust'. Rather than 'a highly organised prostitution empire in the hands of few vice moguls', she argues that prostitution was controlled by an 'informal network' of immigrants (1987: 145).

Draft

that it might become easier to decode the discursive statements that masquerade as descriptions of reality in today's discussions of trafficking. For example, reading that lack of parental protection was a cause of white slavery can help us see claims about the lack of proper parenting in the third world as more than simply inaccurate or discriminatory. The purpose of the examination, however, was not only to lay the groundwork for drawing parallels between white slavery and trafficking, but to establish more completely the framework of myth for looking at trafficking.